



CITY EXPERIENCE  
Mayor's Office of Resilience and Equity

## Beyond Apology Commission

Special Meeting | November 16, 2024 | 9:00 am – 1:00 pm

City Hall at One Technology Center | 10 North Meeting Room

### Meeting Minutes

Commissioners Present: TheRese Anderson Aduni, Phil Armstrong, Jacqueline Evans, Vanessa Hall-Harper, Mattece Mason, D'Marria Monday, Tim Newton, Greg Taylor, Kristi Williams, Corinice Wilson, Damali Wilson

Commissioners Absent: Keith Mayes

City of Tulsa Staff Present: Lexi Bollis, Jack Blair, Kyra Carby, Ana Ibarra, Krystal Reyes, James Wagner

#### I. Call to Order

- a. Meeting called to order at 9:13 am.

#### II. Design Session: Tulsa's Housing Reparations Program

- a. Greg Robinson facilitated via Microsoft Teams.
- b. The commission opened with a puzzle activity highlighting the importance of each commissioner bringing forward the piece of the puzzle they have. The group may not have all the pieces or expertise needed, but collectively can bring in all needed pieces.
- c. Commissioners individually reflected on the question "What are we trying to accomplish?" in eight to ten words, without using the word "reparations." After writing, commissioners shared their answers in pairs.
  - i. Commissioners were then challenged to cut their answers down to four to five words. They shared their new responses in pairs.
  - ii. Commissioners then cut their answers down to one to two words. Each commissioner shared their words with the group.
    1. Commissioner Responses:
      - a. Commissioner Newton: Opportunity, restoration
      - b. Commissioner Taylor: generational land
      - c. Vice Chair Corinice Wilson: heal, transformative
      - d. Commissioner Aduni: restore neighborhoods
      - e. Commissioner Monday: invest in disinvestment
      - f. Councilor Hall-Harper: cash, land
      - g. Chairwoman Williams: restore wealth
      - h. Commissioner Damali Wilson: renewal, community
      - i. Commissioner Armstrong: restore
      - j. Commissioner Evans: funds, unity



CITY EXPERIENCE  
Mayor's Office of Resilience and Equity

- k. Commissioner Mason: equity, protect
2. Lexi read all responses aloud and the commission discussed the words.
  - a. Councilor Hall-Harper asked Commissioner Monday to clarify her use of “disinvestment.” Commissioner Monday clarified her thinking that repairing systemic harm is the opposite of disinvestment.
  - b. Commissioner Taylor asked Commissioner Evans what she sees as the scope of unity. Commissioner Evans responded that she’s seen the community historically not have the togetherness that would benefit them.
  - c. Commissioner Mason was asked to elaborate on her choice of “protect.” Commissioner Mason shared that it came from equity—equality doesn’t get us to baseline, equity encompasses repair. Need to protect equity when it is achieved. Getting to baseline is not enough. If we can put policy, funds, or opportunity in place, need to protect what has been made whole.
    - i. Commissioner Armstrong: Protect from what?
    - ii. Commissioner Mason: system, racism, degradation of self-esteem.
    - iii. Chairwoman Williams: for example, freezing property taxes is a way to protect.
    - iv. Vice Chair Corinice Wilson: need to identify policy to codify protections.
    - v. Commissioner Armstrong: needs to be in bylaws, city ordinance.
  - d. Commissioners individually reflected on the questions: What do we need to recover from? What do we need protection from?
    - i. Systemic racism, white supremacy, hinderances from growing generational wealth, continued harm from 1921 Race Massacre, doing double the work to accomplish something
    - ii. Need to develop a harm report.
      1. First: 1921 Tulsa Race Massacre
      2. Then: Red lining, Urban Renewal (1926 – 1971)
      3. Then: Loan denial, disinvestment, appraisal discrimination, depressed property value (1971 – 2020)
    - iii. Data points to address
      1. Homeownership rate for Black vs white Tulsans
      2. Loan approval rates
      3. Black applicants face a 2.5x higher loan denial rate than white Tulsans
      4. Devaluation of homes based on the area
      5. Rent cost burden



CITY EXPERIENCE  
Mayor's Office of Resilience and Equity

6. Wage disparity contributing to buying homes
  7. Commissioner Armstrong: Must quantify number of people displaced, leading to disparities.
  8. Commissioner Taylor: Data on disproportionate taxes paid by Black households based on appraisal system, therefore the City owes these families money back.
- e. What is our blueprint? City of Evanston
  - f. Commissioners individually reflected on the questions: Who needs to be able to access reparative support? Who goes first?
    - i. Need to clarify definition of descendant.
    - ii. Race Massacre survivors, their descendants, and residents of north Tulsa, particularly the historic Greenwood District and surrounding neighborhoods (from Beyond Apology EO).
  - g. Who do we need to make sure finally gets to come into the house?
    - i. Been 100+ years since the massacre, 3 – 4 generations. Need to at least think about remedies for at least 3 – 4 generations.
    - ii. Who has traditionally been left out? What do different generations need?
    - iii. Commission discussed and worked to come to consensus.
      1. Commissioner Monday: Keep in mind Black folks impacted by mass incarceration, leads to increased.
      2. Chairwoman Williams: Reminder the two living survivors.
      3. Residency conversation: city vs county, close descendants who live outside Tulsa or Oklahoma
      4. Greg reminds the commission not to limit themselves too much upfront, parameters will be put in place by City and legal, push legal to be creative.
      5. Consensus on priority order:
        - a. Survivors of 1921 Race Massacre
        - b. Descendants of those affected by 1921 Race Massacre
        - c. Black Tulsans impacted by historic housing discrimination between 1926 – 1971
        - d. Black Tulsans impacted by historic housing discrimination between 1971 – 2020
  - h. What are the bones of the program? Identify at least one direct and one indirect benefit to support each priority group. Tie support to group provided to.
    - i. Examples of direct benefits: cash, downpayment assistance, rehab assistance, rental assistance
    - ii. Examples of indirect benefits: policy, land acquisition, institutional support/development, tax incentives/waivers
    - iii. Commissioners discussed in small groups, then brought their ideas to the whole commission.
      1. Vice Chair Corinice Wilson: direct benefits – cash to survivors for housing costs, other direct benefits tiered based on priority group. Indirect benefits – creation of a land trust, tax incentives/waivers



CITY EXPERIENCE  
Mayor's Office of Resilience and Equity

included so those part of appraisal/construction process address historical harm. Objective governing board for CDC that is created, not owned by any particular group, representative of those being served.

2. Commissioner Mason: direct benefits – homebuyer assistance to families (down payment assistance, closing costs) to increase access to homeownership, home preservation program for low income home owners to help them stay in their home, rehab and renovation program for current homeowners to help with essential upgrades to increase energy efficiency and keep property values up to address appraisal disparity, property tax distress assistance for seniors and individuals with disabilities to help them retain homeownership. Indirect benefits – property and foreclosure counseling, financial literacy and wealth-building program, community revitalization increase supply of affordable housing.
  - i. Components the commission didn't get to: What specialist do we need to build out the details of the program? What do people need to be able to see?
  - j. Greg will draft a memo based on everything brought forward by the commission today and share with commission.
    - i. Named that it will have gaps in terms of needed expertise, community engagement and feedback.
    - ii. What questions does the commission know we have but need expert support to answer them? Get those questions to Chairwoman Williams or Vice Chair Corinice Wilson.
  - k. In closing, Greg called forward how each commissioner has been placed here for a reason.

### III. Adjournment

- a. Chairwoman Williams entertained a motion to adjourn.
  - i. Commissioner Aduni made a motion, Commissioner Monday seconded.
    1. Aye: 10
    2. Commissioner Damali Wilson left the meeting prior to the motion.
- b. Motion carried, meeting adjourned at 1:09 pm.